

GMO crops The science vs. the controversy

Steve Strauss

Oregon State University Steve.Strauss@OregonState.Edu

Why do GMOs matter to you?

- Conflicting information about them is widespread – I want truth
- Not being duped by costly but unfounded greenwash and natural food claims
- Wish to see **wise use of a critical technology** for food, medicine, and energy production
- Urgent issue for the poor and under a changing climate

Fake news and fake science is widespread

It's hard to tell what science is saying amidst all the noise



GENETICALLY MODIFIED FOOD IS EV

AAAS: Position on GMO labeling

"Legally mandating such a label can only serve to mislead and falsely alarm consumers"

Statement by the AAAS Board of Directors On Labeling of Genetically Modified Foods

AMERICAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF SCIENCE 20 October 2012

There are several current efforts to require labeling of foods containing products derived from genetically modified crop plants, commonly known as GM crops or GMOs. These efforts are not driven by evidence that GM foods are actually dangerous. Indeed, the science is quite clear: crop improvement by the modern molecular techniques of biotechnology is safe. Rather, these initiatives are driven by a variety

conclusion: consuming foods containing ingredients derived from GM crops is no riskier than consuming the same foods containing ingredients from crop plants modified by conventional plant improvement techniques.

Civilization rests on people's ability to modify plants to make them more suitable as food, feed and fiber plants and all of these modificaadded, the protein must be shown to be neither toxic nor allergenic. As a result and contrary to popular misconceptions, GM crops are the most extensively tested crops ever added to our for

occasional clain foods to animal ranging from dig to sterility, tumo

Approved by the AAAS Board of Directors on 20 October 2012



death. Although such claims are often sensationalized and receive a

GMO warning labels common



Vicious anti-GMO messages widespread



There are numerous myths that are rampant and recycled in media



National Research Council Report 2016

- Confirmed food safety
- Confirmed

 insecticide reduction
 with pest resistant
 corn





AMA



actentific justification for labeling of genetically hodified for genetically

ISF

ISAS

(2)

ed on structly scientific



























影響器



The scientific consensus around the safety of genetically modified foods is as strong as the scientific consensus around climate change. These foods are subjected to more testing than any other, and everything tells us that they're safe.

ICSU

Is GM food safe?

if an overwhelming majority of experts say something is true, then any sensible non-expert should assume that they are probably right



The American Association for the Advancement of Science is an international non-profit organization AAAS serves some 261 affiliated societies and academies of science.

"The science is quite clear: crop improvement by the modern molecular techniques of biotechnology is safe."



The National Academy of Sciences is a non-profit organization in the United States. It is the premier scientific body in the United States

"To date more than 98 million acres of genetically modified crops have been grown worldwide. No evidence of human health problems associated with the ingestion of these crops or resulting food products have been identified"



The premier body of physicians in the United States

"There is no scientific justification for special labeling of genetically modified foods.

Bioengineered foods have been consumed for close to 20 years, and during that time, no overt consequences on human health have been reported and/or substantiated in the peer-reviewed literature."



England's top medical society, the Royal Society of Medicine is an independent educational organisation for doctors, dentists, scientists and others involved in medicine and health

"Foods derived from GM crops have been consumed by hundreds of millions of people across the world for more than 15 years, with no reported



version 2

Organization

The World Health Organization (WHO) is the directing and coordinating authority for health within the United Nations system. "No effects on human health have been shown as a result of the consumption of GM foods by the general population in the countries where they have been approved.



The European Commission (EC) is the executive body of the European Union

"The main conclusion to be drawn from the efforts of more than 130 research projects, covering a period of more than 25 years of research, and involving more than 500 independent research groups, is that biotechnology, and in particular GMOs, are no more risky than e.g. conventional plant breeding

http://www.axismundionline.com/blog/the-new-is-gm-foodsafe-meme/

Pew Survey on views of controversial science issues - 2015

PewResearchCenter

NUMBERS, FACTS AND TRENDS SHAPING THE WORLD

FOR RELEASE JANUARY 29, 2015

Public and Scientists' Views on Science and Society

Both the public and scientists value the contributions of science, but there are large differences in how each perceives science issues. Both groups agree that K-12 STEM education falls behind other nations.

A PEW RESEARCH CENTER STUDY CONDUCTED IN COLLABORATION WITH THE AMERICAN ASSOCIATION FOR THE ADVANCEMENT OF SCIENCE (AAAS)

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION ON THIS REPORT:

Cary Funk, Associate Director, Research Lee Rainie, Director, Internet, Science and Technology Research Dana Page, Communications Manager 202.419.4372 www.pewresearch.org

http://www.pewinternet.org/2015/01/29/public-and-scientists-views-on-science-and-society/

PewRes	earch(Center _{In}	ternet, Scie	ence & Tec	ch
PUBLICATIONS	TOPICS	PRESENTATIONS	INTERACTI	RELIGION VES KEY	
JANUARY 28, 2015	CTC! VIEWS ON S	OFFICE AND SOCIETY		fex	
PUBLIC AND SCIENTS	STS' VIEWS ON S	CIENCE AND SOCIETY			
88% of AAA	S scienti	sts say gene	tically r	nodifie	d
TOODS are sa	are to eat	; only 37% o	of the pu	blic ag	rees
	Mill 100 100 21 21 2	(als 2333333333333	The state of the s	Contraction of the second	State of the

GMOs the largest scientist-public gap, 51%, of any issue surveyed

of AAAS scientists say genetically modified foods are safe to eat; only

PEW RESEARCH CENTER Robert Nickelsberg/Getty Images

37% of the public agrees

Opinion Differences Between Public and Scientists

% of U.S. adults and AAAS scientists saying each of the following

Comedical sciences	U.S. adults	AAAS scientists
Safe to eat genetically modified foods	37%	51 point gap 088%
Favor use of animals in research	47 🖤	42 O 89
Safe to eat foods grown with pesticides	28 🜒 40	068
Humans have evolved over time		65 33 O 98
Childhood vaccines such as MMR should be required		68 18 💽 86

Climate, energy, space sciences

Climate change is mostly due to human activity		50%	3	7 point gap	087%	5
Growing world population will be a major problem			59 🧲	23	0 82	
Favor building more nuclear power plants		45 👥	20	0 65		
Favor more offshore drilling	32 0	20	52			
Astronauts essential for future of U.S. space prograr	n	47 0	12 ●	59		
Favor increased use of bioengineered fuel				68 🔵 10 (D 78	
Favor increased use of fracking	31 0 8	9 39				
Space station has been a good investment for U.S.			6	4 OO 68		

Survey of U.S. adults August 15-25, 2014. AAAS scientists survey Sept. 11-Oct. 13, 2014. Other responses and those saying don't know or giving no answer are not shown.

PEW RESEARCH CENTER

http://www.pewinternet.org/2015/01/29/public-and-scientists-views-on-science-and-society/

Are GE/GMO foods safe? Are they good for the environment?



GE/GMO a technology with diverse outcomes, including many.....

- Genes/traits Types of crops Places
- Societies Crop/Eco-systems

• A general technology: More like a wheel or computer than a medicine or saxophone

• "Product not process," "case by case," is global consensus for science assessments

The more relevant question

- Is agriculture becoming more prosustainable, efficient, and residue
- If food becoming safer an

Agenda

- What they are and are not a brief reminder
- Extent in the world
- Some impacts
- New forms in pipeline
- Why so controversial, stigmatized?

Where did our crops come from? Answer: All over the world



Reprinted by permission from Macmillan Publishers Ltd.: [Nature] Diamond, J. (2002). Evolution, consequences and future of plant and animal domestication. Nature 418: 700-707, copyright 2002.

Most crops intensively bred, prior to GMOs







Kohlrabi Germany, 100 AD

Mutants are some of our best friends: Domestication of wild cabbage

Ornamental kale Late 1900's











Brussel sprouts Belgium, 1700's



Many plant varieties derived from randomly induced mutations



Calrose 76 semi-dwarf rice



Rio Red grapefruit

Over 3,000 crop varieties derived from mutagenesis have been commercialized



High oleic sunflower

Radical changes in domesticated animals All dogs derived from the wolf by breeding



Bottom line: The crops we grow, and thus the food we eat, are not natural

What is genetic engineering (GE)

- Direct modification of DNA
 - s. indirect modification in breeding
- Asexually modified in somatic cells
 - Then regenerated into whole organisms, usually starting in Petri dishes



Steps to create a GE plant



Then plants are propagated normally (seeds, cuttings) and tested for health and new qualities



Propagation of poplars in tissue culture



Growth in the field

Insect-resistant "Bt crops"

More efficient and less harmful to non-targets than sprays --Bt sprays widely used in organic agriculture





The Gene Machine

What the CRISPR experiments mean for humanity By Alice Park



Sandman CRISPR !



Markets are another thing.... **The National Organic Standard Boards has banned** gene editing technologies

HOME , ARTICLES , ALL NEWS , CATTLE AND BEEF INDUSTRY NEWS , ORGANIC BOARD BANS GENE EDITING TECHNOLOGY

Organic board bans gene editing technology

CATTLE AND BEEF INDUSTRY NEWS

NOV 25, 2016 By KERRY HALLADAY, WLJ MANAGING EDITOR



When a government agency describes something as causing the "demise" of species and displacing Americans, they must surely be describing a foreign enemy, right? Or maybe some pandemic plaguing the country side?

Apparently not. To the p Organic Standards Boar would, among other thir from being considered c engineering—an "exclud additionally attributed m

"Every organic stakehold

Cas 9, Zinc Finger Nuclea engineering for the purp of "excluded methods" o

"Every organic stakeholder is clear that genetic engineering is an imminent threat to organic Among other things the integrity. Every effort must be made to protect that integrity,"

Agenda

- What they are and are not a brief reminder
- Extent in the world
- Some impacts
- New forms in pipeline
- Why so controversial, stigmatized?

First generation herbicide and insect resistant crops were rapidly adopted by farmers, both in the developed and developing world

Global Area of Biotech Crops, 1996 to 2015: Industrial and Developing Countries (M Has, M Acres)



Two traits dominate worldwide, increasingly "stacked" in combinations Global Area of Biotech Crops, 1996 to 2015: By Trait (Million Hectares, Million Acres) ISAA **M** Acres 297 120 247 100 198 80

> 148 60 99 40 49 20 0 0 1936 1997 1998 1999 2000 2001 2002 2003 2004 2005 2006 2007 2008 2009 2010 2011 2012 2013 5

Source: Clive James, 2015

Four crops dominate, 8+ crops in USA

Global Area of Biotech Crops, 1996 to 2015: By Crop (Million Hectares, Million Acres)





Source: Clive James, 2015

Adoption by 28 countries, but rates highly variable

Global Area (Million Hectares) of Biotech Crops, 2015: by Country





million hectares.

Biotech Mega Countries

50,000 hectares (125,000 acres), or more

		Million Hectare
1.	USA	70.9
2.	Brazil*	44.2
3.	Argentina*	24.5
4.	India*	11.6
5.	Canada	11.0
6 .	China*	3.7
7.	Paraguay*	3.6
8.	Pakistan*	2.9
9.	South Africa*	2.3
10.	Uruguay*	1.4
11.	Bolivia*	1.1
12.	Philippines*	0.7
13.	Australia	0.7
14.	Burkina Faso*	0.4
15.	Myanmar*	0.3
16.	Mexico*	0.1
17.	Spain	0.1
18.	Colombia*	0.1
19.	Sudan*	0.1

Less than 50,000 hectares

Honduras* Chile* Portugal Vietnam* Czech Republic Slovakia Costa Rica* Bangladesh* Romania

* Developing countries

Accidental mixing of GM and non-GM crops/food create great problems

Many costly cases of trade disruption and lawsuits with corn, soy, and rice



Steady increase in incidents of genetically modified crops found in traded food, UN agency reports



Source: UN Photo/Tobin Jones

14 March 2014 – As a result of the increased production of genetically modified crops worldwide, the United Nations food agency warns in a ground-breaking survey that an increasing number of incidents of low levels of genetically modified organisms (GMOs) are being reported in traded food and feed.



Local controversy too: GMO ban voted on in Benton County, Oregon in 2015



Agenda

- What are they and are not a brief reminder
- Extent in the world
- Some impacts
- New forms in pipeline
- Why so controversial, stigmatized?

Virus-resistant GM papaya Saved the Hawaiian industry in the mid-1990s, ~80% of crop today

Like a vaccine

"RNAi immunization" via implanting a viral gene in the papaya genome



Courtesy of Denis Gonsalves, formerly of Cornell University

GMO, virusresistant trees

Global "meta-analysis" of early impacts: 2014

	Subject Areas	For Authors	About Us	Search	Q dvanced search
G OPEN ACCESS PEER-REVIEWED RESEARCH ARTICLE	of Consticution	Madified (2 Saves	0 Citations
A Meta-Analysis of the Impacts of Genetically Modified Crops Wilhelm Klümper, Matin Qaim Published: November 3, 2014 • DOI: 10.1371/journal.pone.0111629				79,064 Views	948 Shares

"147 original studies were included." "On average, GM technology adoption has reduced chemical pesticide use by 37%, increased crop yields by 22%, and increased farmer profits by 68%."

National Research Council Report 2010

- Major pesticide reductions - Bt
- Expanded conservation tillage
- Herbicide tolerant weeds
 - Need more sustainable management



Herbicide tolerant plants promote conservation tillage – With many environmental benefits thereof

Conservation Technology Information Center

- Lowers greenhouse gas emissions
- Improves soil organic matter
- Reduces erosion and fertilizer runoff into water



Poor weed management has led to rapid development of herbicide-resistant weeds And motivated development of new kinds of herbicide tolerant crops



"The number of weed species evolving resistance to glyphosate

BALL BARKSDALE / AGSTOCKUSA /

Roundup tolerant bentgrass escape in

Oregon

Feds deregulate controversial GMO grass seed





Linn County bills itself as the grass seed capital of the world. But the thriving grass business has been divided by a controversial genetically modified grass developed by Scotts Miracle-Gro. (Jeff Manning/The Oregonian)



on January 18, 2017 at 10:00 AM, updated January 18, 2017 at 10:18 AM

The U.S. Department of Agriculture on Tuesday deregulated a genetically modified grass that some Oregon farmers and dealers say threatens the state's grass seed business.



http://www.oregonlive.com/business/index.ssf/2017/01/post 248.html

play 'hangn is fired, law

Herbicide-resistant weeds are an old problem in agriculture, but exacerbated by GE herbicide tolerant crops

THE RISE OF SUPERWEEDS

Weed species often become resistant to herbicides. Glyphosate resistance, once deemed unlikely, rose after genetically engineered crops were introduced in the mid-1990s.



Accelerated by GE Rounduptolerant crops ?



24 | NATURE | VOL 497 | 2 MAY 2013

Agenda

- What they are and are not a brief reminder
- Extent in the world
- Some impacts
- New forms in pipeline
- Why so controversial, stigmatized?

Newly approved GE crop varieties in USA

- Soybean insect resistant (Apr. 2014)
- Alfalfa reduced lignin (Nov. 2014)
- Potato reduced black spot bruise and low acrylamide production (Nov. 2014), reduced browning and disease resistant as well (August 2015)
- Soybean and cotton new herbicide tolerances (Jul. 2014 – Jan. 2015)
- Apple non-browning (Feb. 2015)
- Plum virus resistant (2014)







Non-browning "Arctic Apple" Reduced spoilage/waste, improved quality – USDA approved



Courtesy of Jennifer Armen, Okanagan Specialty Fruits, Canada



Non-browning "Arctic Apple" Time lapse video

Arctic Apples

Genetically engineered to be non-browning when sliced. Developed by a small Canadian company, Okanagan Sepcialty Fruits Approved for consumption and cultivation in the US in Feb 2015

They tasted good for several hours



"Innate" potato – native DNA, nonbrowning and other traits

One hour after cutting – Control vs. Innate





Two days after cutting – Control vs. Innate "Innate" potato 2.0 – late blight resistant, reduced acrylamide, reduced sprouting and browning (\downarrow waste, \uparrow safety, \downarrow pesticide, \uparrow yield)



Potential Innate Potato benefits

- If all USA potatoes had it's improved traits, each year....
- Waste reduced by 5 billion pounds
- CO₂ emissions reduced by 734 million pounds
- Water use reduced by 84 billion gallons
- 2.5 million fewer pesticide acre-applications
- Marketable yields increase ~ 20%
- Growers save \$240 million in production costs



Drought-tolerant maize – Planted on >150,000 acres – Also tested in Africa Important tool given climate change, water shortages?



Advanced Biotechnology

Because of the advanced drought-tolerant biotech trait, Genuity' DroughtGard" Hybrids adapt to drought conditions. Slowing down water consumption and using available water more efficiently to help endure the stress.

The Result

Superior genetics along with innovative drought-tolerant trait technology helps DroughtGard Hybrids withstand drought conditions for a better chance of maximizing kernels per ear and overall yield potential.



THE INNOVATOR OF HYDROEFFICIENCY Visit your seed rep or geneity com/droughtpand

Hydroefficiency

Doing more with less water.

Diverse pipeline of biofortification products = enhancement of critical vitamins or nutrients Food for Thought Ancher entersative ship haves in the networking





veststand the presend and political lattice he has

faced during its development.

THURSDAY OCT. 13 4-5PM

Why use breeding and biotechnology for βcarotene (pro-vitamin A) enrichment? Deficiency is widespread, impacts severe, and decades of supplements are unable to overcome



Vitamin A deficiency is estimated to affect approximately **one third of children under the age of five around the world**. It is estimated to **claim the lives of 670,000 children under five annually**. Approximately **250,000-500,000 children in developing countries become blind each year** owing to vitamin A deficiency.... Biofortified plants are improving nutrition for many today, and can do more with aid of GE methods





Biofortification breeding well underway, including a provitamin A enriched sweet potato that is **currently** being grown by > half a million families.

Other projects are underway to increase levels of protein, iron, zinc, antioxidants, and other beneficial components in food.

Gates Foundation a major supporter

The HarvestPlus program – worldwide impact by traditional breeding

- Nutrient targets start at:
 - 30% of the EAR of iron
 - 40% of the EAR of zinc
 - 50% of the EAR of provitamin A
- Reaches more than 40 countries









Biotech methods useful where breeding is ineffective or slow

- Rice
- Cassava
- Sorghum
- Banana



Agenda

- What they are and are not a brief reminder
- Extent in the world
- Some impacts
- New forms in pipeline
- Why so controversial, stigmatized?

Why the GMO controversy ?

 "It is accurate to say that many of the real ethical issues [of GMOs in agriculture] have little to do with the use of transgenic technologies" (Burkardt et al. 2005, Agricultural Ethics, CAST)



Agricultural Ethics

NTRODUCTION

It is widely known that agriculture has a long history. Starting approximately 12,000 years ago, the domestication of plants and animals began independently in several different places, including centers in West Asia, East Asia, Central America, and South America. Domestication also may have occurred in other locations, although convincing archeological evidence has not been found. In the TASK FORCE MEMBERS: Jeffrey Burkhardt, Chair, Department of Food and Resource Economics, University of Florida, Gainesville; Gary Comstock, Department of Philosophy and Religion, North Carolina State University, Raleigh; Peter G. Hartel, Department of Crop and Soil Sciences, University of Georgia, Athens; Paul B. Thompson, Department of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing; REVIEWERS: Maarten J. Chrispeels, Center for Molecular Agriculture, University of California–San Diego; Charles C. Muscoplat, College of Agricultural, Food and Environmental Sciences, University of Minnesota, St. Paul; RobertStreiffer, Department

commented on the importance of agricultural knowledge in the quest for the "good life" by the individual and the polity. The fundamental value of agriculture was highlighted by Enlightenment thinkers from John Locke to Thomas Jefferson, who underscored the political, economic, and philosophical importance of "tillers of the soil" (Spiegel 1991). In the United States, problems faced by farmers became the focus of the nine-

What are the key factors?

- Complexity in an internet powered world looking for slogans and simple answers

 Clean label movement
- 2. Vested interest in stigma for economic and ideological reasons
 - GMO-free food popular, creating mixture problems
 - Internet, media celebrity experts
 - Fake and "half-truthed" news and science
- 3. Phobia for pesticides, chemicals in any dose
 - The "Food Babe" effect
- 4. Scientific novelty and complexity vs. inertia of regulations and marketing systems

My list of key factors

- 5. Roles and perceptions of large seed/chemical and food corporations the "Monsanto effect"
- 6. Tool in global battles / trade wars
- Scientific complexity of environmental impacts biodiversity vs. climate vs. pesticide impacts
- 8. Poor management, fear of herbicide tolerant GE crops
- 9. Legal complications and perceptions around gene flow and patents
- 10.Decreasing confidence in experts, scientists who to trust?

More fun....

I'm no ordinary apple I'm a genetically modified one that never rots

facebook.com/theorganicindian

TAKE A BITE



My colleague Steve Savage's favorite!



Much pseudo-science: "Half of all children will be Autistic by 2025 due to Roundup warns MIT scientist"



Abe Lincoln warned us, but....



http://weknowmemes.com/2012/07/dont-believe-everything-you-read-on-the-internet



FOOD SERVICE BEVERAC

FROZEN FOODS

TREND OF THE YEAR VISIT FOOD



Trend of the Year: Clean Label

Industry answers the call for simple ingredients

.foodbusinessnews.net/corporateprofiles/2015/trend



Kraft has announced that the orange glow of its iconic Macaroni & Cheese will no longer come from synthetic coloring agents. (Keyonk Djansezian / Cetty images) http://www.coloragoot.ribumoc.com/buccipoccc/ccc.clooph_lobolc_food_0210_20160218_ctopy_btps//

nent for

2 clicks to share all your big files.



GMO-free labels a significant feature of clean label movement





Summary

- GMO is a breeding method not a particular kind of product
- Large benefits for economics, soil tillage, humanitarian applications
- Also very significant management, global acceptance, and trade problems
- Diverse pipeline of new products
- "Clean label" movement limiting GMOs, teaching public they are unsafe as a group?
- Decreasing trust in scientists, government, media, many institutions inflames and confuses

